Issues relating to media, freedom of speech and human rights within a democratic society span the Learning Outcomes (LOs) and Assessment Standards (ASs) across the Life Orientation curriculum for Grade 10 – 12. This Common Assessment Task (CAT) has drawn on those guidelines to provide a task which allows learners to explore a range of related themes as they occur in society.

The following areas of media, freedom of speech and human rights are addressed in the preparatory exercises:

- Freedom of expression through the ages
- Functions of the media
- Public figures and the right to privacy
- Freedom of expression in South Africa
- Black Tuesday
- Censorship: the artists' enemy
- Desensitisation due to media
- Media and stereotyping
- Promoting gender equality in and through the media
- Freedom of expression versus the right to dignity

Learning Outcomes and Assessment Standards

**LEARNING OUTCOME 2**
Demonstrate an understanding and appreciation of the values and rights that underpin the Constitution in order to practise responsible citizenship, and to enhance social justice and sustainable living.

**Grade 10**
AS 10.2.2: Explain the value of diversity, and discuss contemporary contributions of individuals and groups in addressing discrimination and violations of human rights.

**Grade 11**
AS 11.2.2: Formulate strategies based on national and international instruments for identifying and intervening in discrimination and violations of human rights.

**Grade 12**
AS 12.2.2: Evaluate own positions taken when dealing with discrimination and human rights violations, taking into account the Bill of Rights.
AS 12.2.3: Analyse and debate the role of the media in a democratic society.

**LEARNING OUTCOME 3:**
Explore and engage responsibly in recreation and physical activities, to promote well-being.

**Grade 10**
AS 10.3.3: Analyse the coverage of sport, sporting personalities and recreational activities by the media and suggest ways of redressing biases and unfair practices in the world of sport.

**Grade 12**
AS 12.3.4: Investigate how ideologies, beliefs and worldviews influence the construction of and participation in a recreational and physical activity.
PREPARATORY TASKS

INTRODUCTION

Since the 1994 election South Africa has become part of the community of democratic countries. It is important to understand what it means to be a citizen in a democracy and to exercise our rights and responsibilities.

Definitions and extracts that will assist in understanding and engaging with the CAT:

Democracy
de·moc·ra·cy

1. Government by the people exercised either directly or through elected representatives.
2. A political or social unit that has such a government.
3. The common people, considered as the primary source of political power.
4. Majority rule.
5. The principles of social equality and respect for the individual within a community.

[<http://www.thefreedictionary.com/democracy>]

One of the most important functions of a democracy is that each person has a voice, in other words, they have the right to express their opinion as long as these words do not compromise the rights of other citizens.

Freedom of expression could be considered one of the most fundamental of all freedoms. While it is of dubious value to rate one freedom over another, freedom of expression is a basic foundation of democracy – it is a core freedom, without which democracy could not exist. The term encompasses not only freedom of speech and media, but also freedom of thought, culture and intellectual inquiry. Freedom of expression guarantees everyone's right to speak and write openly without state interference, including the right to criticise injustices, illegal activities and incompetencies. It guarantees the right to inform the public and to offer opinions of any kind, to advocate change, to give the minority the opportunity to be heard and become the majority and to challenge the rise of state tyranny by force of words.

[<http://www.democracyweb.org/expression/principles.php>]

In South Africa, citizens' rights are protected in Chapter Two of our Constitution. The chapter is known as the Bill of Rights. One of the central rights that is enshrined in our constitution is the right to freedom of speech and expression.

The South African Bill of Rights (Chapter Two of the Constitution)

Freedom of expression

Section 16 contains detailed provisions with regard to freedom of expression, stating, 'Everyone has the right to freedom of expression, which includes freedom of the press and other media; freedom to receive or impart information or ideas; freedom of artistic creativity; and academic freedom and freedom of scientific research.'

Section 16 contains the following limitations to freedom of expression: 'The right in subsection (1) does not extend to propaganda for war; incitement of imminent violence; or advocacy of hatred that is based on race, ethnicity, gender or religion, and that constitutes incitement to cause harm.'
**Media**

Communication channels through which news, entertainment, education, data, or promotional messages are disseminated. Media includes mediums such as newspapers, magazines, TV, radio, billboards, direct mail, telephone, fax and Internet (blogs, Twitter, etc.)

[Adapted from: <http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/media.html>]

---

**QUESTION 1**

**FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION THROUGH THE AGES**

From time immemorial, society has spoken out on the ideals of freedom of expression. Read the following quotations and answer the question below:

> 'This is true liberty, when free-born men, having to advise the public, may speak free.'
> Euripides, Greek playwright (480 – 406 BC)

> 'Give me liberty to know, to utter, and to argue freely according to conscience, above all liberties.'
> John Milton, English poet (1644)

> 'The free communication of ideas and opinions is one of the most precious of the rights of man. Every citizen may, accordingly, speak, write and print with freedom …'
> French National Assembly, *Declaration of the Rights of Man, 26 August* (1789)

> 'Freedom of expression – in particular, freedom of the press – guarantees popular participation in the decisions and actions of government, and popular participation is the essence of our democracy.'
> Corazon Aquino, former President of the Philippines (1933 – 2009)

1.1 Why do you think the desire for freedom of expression has been of such importance through the centuries?
QUESTION 2

FUNCTIONS OF THE MEDIA

The media has immense power because many people get their news from the media rather than from other people or other sources. The media dictates what is considered to be important through what material it selects to cover.

Setting the Agenda

Journalists cannot report on an infinite number of stories, so they must choose those which are the most newsworthy. By choosing which stories to present to the public, the news media helps determine the most important issues; in other words, the journalists set the agenda. Agenda-setting is crucial because it shapes which issues will be debated in public. Sometimes political scientists refer to agenda-setting as signalling because the media signals which stories are the most important when they decide what to report.

Being the Common Carrier

The media plays a common-carrier role by providing a line of communication between the government and the people. This communication goes both ways: the people learn about what the government is doing and the government learns from the media what the public is thinking.

2.1 Find and discuss some examples in the local or international press in which the media serves the purpose of acting as the common carrier.

2.2 Should journalists mirror the government's views in determining which issues should be highlighted in the media and debated in public forums? Explain your viewpoint by referring to the function of the media in a democratic society.

Acting as the Public Representative

The media sometimes acts as a public representative by holding government officials accountable on behalf of the people. Many people argue that the media is ill-equipped to play this role because the media does not face the same type of accountability that politicians face. Serving as the representative of the public, moreover, could undermine the media's objectivity because the act of representing the people might require reporters to take a position on an issue.

2.3 To what extent is it, in fact, the role of the media to act as the public representative in a society? Provide reasons for your answer.
QUESTION 3

PUBLIC FIGURES AND THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY

Private information about high profile individuals can be publically exposed through the media.

Does being a public figure mean that you should be open to public scrutiny and comment at all times?

Olympic silver medallist, Caster Semenya, is an example of a person who has had the details of her life exposed and debated through the press.

Read the following radio transcript transmitted by the Australian Broadcasting Corporation and answer the questions which follow:

A question of gender: the sex testing of female athletes

Broadcast: Sunday 8 July 2012

Caster Semenya had won the 800 metres at the 2009 World Athletics championship in Berlin, but her victory was thrown into question when questions were raised about her gender. Semenya was required to undergo a series of tests to verify her gender, and was banned from competing. A year later, the International Amateur Athletic Federation accepted the conclusion of a panel of medical experts, which stated that Semenya could compete in women's events.

While Caster Semenya survived the ban and the surrounding media controversy, it must have had a profound effect, as she was only 18 years old at the time. Semenya, however, is not the only elite athlete to have had her gender questioned. You may be surprised to learn that for over 50 years, all elite women athletes had to prove they were actually women – and a number didn't pass the test.

The story begins in the 1950s. The cold war was underway and Eastern Bloc women athletes were outperforming their Western rivals. These were big, strong women whose performances and appearances shocked the West.

Discussion that follows is between the following:

Elizabeth Ferris – British diver who participated in the 1960 Olympics
Rosemary Grimes – former British and Commonwealth record holder in the discus who was first sex tested in 1966
Annabelle Quince – the Australian Broadcasting Corporation presenter

Elizabeth Ferris: In the late '50s and early '60s, there were a number of women track and field athletes, in particular from the Eastern Bloc countries, who were showing physical signs that were more … or less feminine than people had come to expect. And it was a time when culturally women were expected to be very feminine. And a fear therefore built up – a sort of rumour – that maybe these women weren't completely female. Now I don't know what anyone thought that meant, really, but the signs were that they were showing much bigger muscle bulk, they had deepening of the voice, a certain amount of hair on the face, and they were very big and strong, and, very importantly, they were producing incredible performances. And therefore these women were performing in a way that people thought 'normal women' couldn't perform, and therefore there was something strange about them.

Annabelle Quince: Sports officials responded to these suspicions by introducing a sex test for all women athletes, and at first, this was just a simple visual inspection.

Rosemary Grimes: In those days there were no scientific procedures. It was 'Please remove
your clothes and let's have a look', and it was quite embarrassing for everybody.

**Elizabeth Ferris:** The International Amateur Athletic Federation introduced an inspection, a physical inspection test, and in 1966 in Budapest 243 female athletes all paraded in front of three doctors in the nude. And all of these athletes were pronounced 'normal'. Understandably, they all also found it very demeaning. But the important thing was that five world record holders who were expected to compete in Budapest didn't appear. Now, these were the very women who had caused people to have some concern about their ‘femininity’. And they included the two Press sisters, Tamara, who was the double Olympic champion in shot put and discus, and her sister, Erina, also double Olympic champion in the 80-metres hurdle and the pentathlon. The reason given for them not turning up was that their mother was ill. Now, no one knew why – and it's never been proven one way or the other – why these women didn't come. But let it be said that these women are still living as women in their own countries. They certainly were not men masquerading and cheating. Whether they had some other, perhaps genetic difference from a normal woman, we don't know, but they were not men; they were women.


| 3.1 | What impact do you think the media controversy surrounding Caster Semenya and other female athletes such as those mentioned above would have had on them as individuals? |
| 3.2 | Discuss whether limitations of freedom of speech in the South African constitution should be extended to embrace issues of an individual's privacy in the media. |
QUESTION 4

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION IN SOUTH AFRICA

Freedom of expression in South Africa is under scrutiny as a result of the introduction of the Secrecy Bill by the government.

The South African Protection of State Information Bill, formerly named the Protection of Information Bill and commonly referred to as the Secrecy Bill, is a highly controversial piece of proposed legislation which aims to regulate the classification, protection and dissemination of state information, weighing state interests up against transparency and freedom of expression.

The Bill was passed by the National Assembly on 22 November 2011 by a total of 229 'yes' votes to 107 'no' votes and 2 abstentions. The day that the Bill was passed was termed Black Tuesday in the South African Press.

The National Council of Provinces made significant changes to the bill that was approved by the National Assembly, and the assembly must now approve those changes before the bill can be sent to President Zuma to be signed into law.

After the South African Protection of State Information Bill was announced by the government; South Africa's political cartoonists drew up and signed the manifesto below:

WE, THE UNDERSIGNED EDITORIAL CARTOONISTS OF SOUTH AFRICA, CONDEMN ALL POLITICALLY AND RELIGIOUSLY MOTIVATED THREATS AGAINST THE MEDIA.

Freedom of expression is a universal right, and one hard fought for in the struggle for freedom in our country. It is a right which we must not allow to be eroded. We reject the proposed ‘Protection of Information Bill’ and Media Tribunal, and object in the strongest of terms to all acts of intimidation being waged against the media in general and cartoonists in particular.

4.1 What was the motivation for South African cartoonists to draw up this manifesto?
QUESTION 5

BLACK TUESDAY

The University of Cape Town 'censored' their website in solidarity with the Black Tuesday protests against the Secrecy Bill.

Below is the image of UCT's home page of their website on the 22 November 2011.

5.1 What message was being sent by the University of Cape Town, one of the country's long-standing liberal universities, through censoring their website on Black Tuesday?

5.2 Is the South African Protection of State Information Bill a threat to the ideals of democracy? Discuss the reasons for your answer.
QUESTION 6

CENSORSHIP: THE ARTISTS' ENEMY

An extract from: Nadine Gordimer goes back into battle (in response to the proposed media regulations)

Gordimer accepts that the people who will be most affected if the government pursues its proposals are journalists. But she says all creative writers, too, will suffer an insidious attack on their freedoms: first, because they often rely on material being unearthed by journalists, but also because their intellectual space becomes fenced in, their imaginations chained.

"We too are threatened by denial of freedom of the word, which is our form of expression of the lives of the people of South Africa. Journalists give us the facts, but in poetry and plays and novels there is a level of deep complexity, and that would be confined within the forces of government. Our aim is to explore life." That aim, she says, would be compromised by these regulations.

In an essay called A Writer's Freedom, published at the height of apartheid in 1976, she explained why freedom – from fashion and conformity as well as from government interference – was vital. 'Any government, any society – any vision of a future society – that has respect for its writers must set them as free as possible to write in their own various ways, in their own choices of form and language, and according to their own discovery of truth.' At the end of that essay, she quotes Turgenev: 'Without freedom in the widest sense of the word ... a true artist is unthinkable; without that air, it is impossible to breathe.'

Under apartheid, several of Gordimer's books were banned. She had a prominent role in opposing censorship and helped found the Congress of South African Writers. Propagandists believe they have a monopoly on truth; writers recognise their own fallibility – not 'the truth', but the 'truth as you know it'. It is perhaps not the direct assault of the proposed new clampdown on writers' freedoms that she fears most, but its encouragement of a climate in which writers are denied what in her 1976 essay she calls a 'private view'. In a world in which the government decides what can be published, what material threatens the national interest, writers have to take sides; they are forced to become political, and can no longer be themselves. Writing becomes a weapon, rather than an intellectual adventure.

Glossary

Turgenev: Ivan Turgenev was a Russian novelist, short-story writer and playwright.

[Source: Mail & Guardian Online Web Address: <http://www.mg.co.za/article/2010-09-01-nadine-gordimer-goes-back-into-battle>]

6.1 To what extent could censorship possibly cause a situation where artists' and writers' 'intellectual space becomes fenced in, their imaginations chained'?

6.2 Gordimer suggests that when a government enforces censorship and controls what is written, writing becomes a weapon. Do you agree with this observation? Explain your response.
QUESTION 7

DESENSITISATION DUE TO MEDIA

The media plays an essential role in bringing tragedy and human rights' violations to the attention of the world. A phenomenon being researched in recent years is people's reaction to what they are exposed to by the media.

Definition of desensitise

- Make less sensitive: *creams to desensitise the skin at the site of the injection*
- Make (someone) less likely to feel shock or distress at scenes of cruelty or suffering by overexposure to such images: *(as adjective desensitised) people who view such movies become desensitised to violence*

Examine the cartoon below and answer the questions which follow:

![Cartoon Image]

7.1 What is the cartoonist suggesting is the reason that young people commit crimes?

7.2 To what extent do you agree or disagree with the cartoonist's viewpoint?

7.3 Does the exposure of children to distressing media compromise the rights to a safe and secure environment guaranteed in the South African Constitution? Provide reasons for your viewpoint.

7.4 Is the setting of age restrictions by the Film and Publications Board a form a censorship which denies the audience freedom of choice? Justify your answer.
QUESTION 8

MEDIA AND STEREOTYPING

8.1  Read the following quotes and discuss your understanding of them:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The media's the most powerful entity on earth. They have the power to make the innocent guilty and to make the guilty innocent, and that's power. Because they control the minds of the masses.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Malcolm X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>All of us who professionally use the mass media are the shapers of society. We can vulgarise that society. We can brutalise it. Or we can help lift it onto a higher level.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>William Bernbach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8.2  What does the picture below suggest about the media's influence on the creation of stereotypes in society?

8.3  To what extent do you believe that the media is able to create and perpetuate stereotypes in South African society?

Find examples from local newspapers, television or magazines to support your view.
QUESTION 9

PROMOTING GENDER EQUALITY IN AND THROUGH THE MEDIA

**Woman and media**

'Media contributes to the shaping of our understanding of success, beauty and what it means to be male and female.' After they gained independence from the colonial powers, many African countries underwent dramatic changes in their pursuit for democracy. Emphasis on democratic principles such as freedom, diversity and truth resulted in the liberalisation and proliferation of media sectors throughout much of Africa. As a result, 'state domination of media has given way to a multiplicity of privately-owned newspapers and radio stations in many countries across the continent.'

African women have used various opportunities to engage in and create media. For example, Meridian FM in Ghana and MAMA FM in Uganda are both community radio stations that were established by women. Despite these and other similar developments, women's voices remain absent from the decision-making chambers of mainstream media. By dominating the decision-making positions of various media outlets (including press, broadcasting, advertising, film, publishing and even public critique) men control the means of expression and are able to 'convey the ideas and values of a patriarchal order'. Perhaps men prefer to keep women out of powerful media positions because they perceive women to be consumers, not producers, of information.

[Adapted from: Women and media <http://www.consultancyafrica.com>]

9.1 To what extent do you agree or disagree with the statement, 'Media contributes to the shaping of our understanding of success, beauty and what it means to be male and female.?'

Refer to examples from local media to support your view.

9.2 The extract above refers to state domination of media giving way to a multiplicity of privately owned media outlets in many parts of Africa.

What do you think the advantages and disadvantages of this could be?

9.3 What do you think the social impact could be of one gender controlling 'the means of expression'?
QUESTION 10

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION VERSUS THE RIGHT TO DIGNITY

Can an artist paint what he chooses? Can the media report on anything? Read the extract below and answer the question that follows.

Freedom of Expression versus Dignity Transgression

What comes first? Should there be a choice between the two, or should the choice rather be that both these very essential human rights be put on the scales with the two choices in perfect balance? I very much love the cartoonists of the newspapers, and when I could still afford to buy one, I always opened the newspaper at the main page with the cartoon. Some cartoonists are so incredibly talented that they sum up the main news of the day with a few brilliant strokes of the pen. Some of these artists never failed to astound me. But if they start to ridicule what is holy to others, like making fun of the prophet Muhammad, or Jesus, or the Cross or whatever may be hallowed to others, some may share in the fun, while others will be deeply hurt. Can that be called ‘freedom of expression’? I very much doubt that, because the scales are out of balance, favouring ‘freedom of expression’ at a dear cost to the ‘right to dignity’.


10.1 The author unequivocally states that poking fun at what is held as hallowed by others should not fall into the realms of freedom of expression. In cases such as these, which right should be held supreme – the right to freedom of expression or the right to human dignity? Explain your viewpoint.
COMMON ASSESSMENT TASK

TASK AND ASSESSMENT RUBRIC

SECTION A  INDIVIDUAL WORK

1. Select one of the following topic guidelines explored in the preparatory tasks as your focus area for Section A:
   - Freedom of expression through the ages
   - Functions of the media
   - Public figures and the right to privacy
   - Freedom of expression in South Africa
   - Black Tuesday
   - Censorship: The artists' enemy
   - Desensitisation due to media
   - Media and stereotyping
   - Promoting gender equality in and through the media
   - Freedom of expression versus the right to dignity

2. Use your selected topic as a focus theme to respond to ONE of the following questions:

   QUESTION 1
   'A democratic society holds human rights supreme.'
   To what extent does the media's freedom of expression in a democratic society impact on human rights?

   QUESTION 2
   'If we conceal what we don't want heard, we are merely hiding injustices, marginalised voices and different ideologies. It is only through the outspoken and inspiring decrees of individuals that we progress.'
   To what extent does present-day media meet the ideals stated in the quote above? [http://www.philosopherzone.com]

3. The medium through which you choose to present your response may take the form of any one of the following:
   - Multimedia
   - Visual diary
   - Scrapbook

   Your response must be a combination of text (words) and image. The images you select must complement the text.

   Your response must include a minimum of six images and contain 500 – 600 words.
## ASSESSMENT RUBRIC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptors</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Engagement with topic</td>
<td><strong>Strong evidence that the learner reflected extensively on chosen question and engaged in robust questioning and analysis of the ideas and opinions within this quotation. There is a strong sense of the learner's own voice contained in original, thought-provoking, comprehensive and insightful ideas which are well-substantiated.</strong> Rigorous attempt to grapple with issues. Insightful unpacking of question.</td>
<td>The essay displays thoughtful reflection in relation to the chosen question and has substance although this is not always fully sustained. The learner's voice is clearly evident and the ideas are thoughtful and contain logical, considered substantiation. Possible tendency to stock response at times. Lacks insight and rigour of an 80%. Learner's response is adequate but level of engagement is not sustained. While there are some valid ideas, these lack sufficient explanation. Possibly an explanation of terms with failure to link focus theme, argument and selected question into a cohesive response.</td>
<td><strong>Some ideas evident but are mostly undeveloped. Learner's response is fragmented and lacks understanding, clarity and conviction. Partial or no reference to question or focus theme. Sweeping generalisations.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration of images and text: images contribute to clarity and effectiveness of argument through integration with text</td>
<td>Task would not be as effective or complete without this particular selection of images integrated to achieve comprehensive understanding of concepts.</td>
<td>An interesting and appropriate selection of images/ contributes successfully to task as a whole through meaningful integration.</td>
<td>Some images selected are appropriate. Bears relation to text at times. Does not provide adequate additional quality to task.</td>
<td>No OR less than minimum required number of images = 0. Random selection of images bearing little or no relation to text.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>20</th>
<th>16 – 20</th>
<th>12 – 15</th>
<th>6 – 11</th>
<th>0 – 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total:</strong></td>
<td>/30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>